

**“Gesualdo’s Transgressive Diatonicism”**  
**Kyle Adams (Indiana University)**

Additional Questions:

*Liam Hynes-Tawa:* Could essential F-sharps also be removed by changing the B-F# fifths into Bb-F ones, rather than by transposing the passage? (In, e.g. “e non vuol dar”)

*Kyle Adams:* In principle, sure. My main concern about that is that it may have the effect of creating bass motion and/or false relations different from the original. For example, at the opening of “Moro, lasso,” if we change B minor to B-flat major, the bass would move down a whole step rather than half-step, and would raise the additional problem of what to do with the (current) GM6/3 sonority—would we keep B-flat in the bass or change to the original B-natural, thereby introducing a chromatic semitone that *wasn’t* in Gesualdo’s original?

The passage in “e non vuol dar” could be changed to B-flat without any significant collateral damage, but one of my goals is to keep as much of the original as possible; i.e., only subtracting rather than adding accidentals where I can. In my 2009 JMT article I refer to this as the “principle of greater simplicity.”

*Nathan Martin:* I may be misremembering: wasn’t there something else odd about how he got into that dissonant fourth above the bass in the second (third?) example? I thought there were two dissonant passing tones in succession (i.e. filling in a fourth). But perhaps I’m misremembering. If not: could that be a class of unusual dissonances to go looking for (picking up Megan Long’s question).

*Kyle Adams:* I don’t see anything like that in that example, but you’re absolutely correct that the two dissonant passing tones in succession is something to be on the lookout for. Thanks!

*Solomon Guhl Miller:* Thank you for this thought-provoking paper. I kept thinking of an example in Vicentino's treatise where in experimenting with the different genera he included an example of a progression in which despite all the accidentals, he employed only major triads. Did you find that a disproportionate number of accidentals ended up changing minor chords to major chords in a similar way?

*Kyle Adams:* Absolutely, without question. The first example that comes to mind is the opening of Lasso’s “Carmina Chromatico”; G major to B minor is unremarkable, but G major to B major is striking.